

This material is part of a collection that documents the harassment, discrimination, and retaliation perpetrated against Alaska's women research scientists by their supervisor, with full knowledge (and arguably, "tacit approval") of their federal employer, the USDA Agricultural Research Service (ARS)

Subject: RE: Manuscripts (ARIS entry)
From: "Bower, Cindy" <Cindy.Bower@ars.usda.gov>
Date: Thu, 24 Sep 2009 18:35:33 -0600
To: "Pantoja, Alberto" <Alberto.Pantoja@ARS.USDA.GOV>
CC: "Contento, Janis" <Janis.Contento@ARS.USDA.GOV>, "Philibert, Juli" <Juli.Philibert@ARS.USDA.GOV>

Alberto,

I have attached a document in another attempt to justify authorship for my co-authors. If this information is sufficient, please let me know and we can cancel our 08:00 meeting Friday morning. Otherwise, I'll see you then. Thanks.

Cindy

From: Pantoja, Alberto
Sent: Wednesday, September 23, 2009 7:54 AM
To: Bower, Cindy
Cc: Contento, Janis; Philibert, Juli; Pantoja, Alberto
Subject: RE: Manuscripts (ARIS entry)

I requested a meeting with my supervisor, Alberto Pantoja, in order to discuss his sudden refusal to allow technicians to serve as co-authors on ARS publications. I had already provided the required written justification, and in this email I provided the information again (showing that the techs met ARS's criteria for authorship).

Cindy

I am still in Palmer; but I have time Friday morning- 8AM in my office- please coordinate with Juli if there is an inconvenient with this time/date.
thanks

alberto

From: Bower, Cindy
Sent: Wed 9/23/2009 6:17 AM
To: Pantoja, Alberto
Cc: Contento, Janis
Subject: Manuscripts (ARIS entry)

Alberto,

If you're available, let's set up a time on Thursday (24 September 2009) to discuss the authorship policies you're trying to implement. Clearly we are interpreting P&P 152.2 differently, since I believe I've successfully met all the specified criteria for justifying authorship, yet apparently my manuscript has still not been approved for entry into ARIS. As you are aware, your current actions will cause me to fail my performance plan, an unwarranted action that will have a devastating effect on my career.

If this is a simple communication problem, unresolvable through emails, then let's arrange a face-to-face meeting where you can explain which aspect of P&P 152.2 that I have in your opinion failed to meet. I am available all day Thursday except for the 1:00 pm FERS meeting. Please suggest a convenient time so we can work together to resolve this issue. Thanks.

Cindy

Authorship_ARS.pdf	Content-Description: Authorship_ARS.pdf
	Content-Type: application/octet-stream
	Content-Encoding: base64

Alberto Pantoja
USDA Agricultural Research Service
PO Box 757200
Fairbanks, AK 99775-7200

24 September 2009

Alberto,

As you required, I have reviewed the list of co-authors on my manuscripts and I believe that each author has participated sufficiently in the work to take public responsibility for the content of the article (according to P&P 152.2 as amended by a PWA memo from 1999). Since your guidance is new and has never been applied to my manuscripts before, I'm finding it difficult to meet all of your demands. In fact, I no longer remember each team-member's exact contribution over the last several years, nor did I keep detailed records with which to defend their authorship now.

However, in a good faith effort to comply, I am providing the following justification for each author that you have rejected:

1.) Dehydration of pollock skins prior to gelatin production

Katie Hietala (previously approved as a co-author for this research; **ARIS Log # 235202**)

- participated in the conception or design, or analysis and interpretation of data by evaluating each suggested desiccant for practical use before its selection as a treatment for drying pollock skins, conducting all analyses carried out in Fairbanks, providing statistical support and offering interpretation of data
- drafted and revised sections of the manuscript (including the materials and methods section)
- will have the opportunity to approve the final version before it is published

Carl Olsen (previously approved as a co-author for this research; **ARIS Log # 235202**)

- participated in the conception or design, or analysis and interpretation of data by evaluating and troubleshooting gelatin film production for the different treatment groups, and by conducting highly technical analyses carried out at WRRC in Albany, CA
- provided important information for the manuscript (including techniques and protocols for the materials and methods section)
- will have the opportunity to approve the final version before it is published

2.) Fermentation of pink salmon using potatoes as a carbohydrate source

Katie Hietala (previously approved as a co-author; **ARIS Log # 235063 and 237469**)

- participated in the conception/design, or analysis/interpretation of data by evaluating each step of the initial salmon-potato experiment and suggesting further

- studies to clarify possible enzyme interference, as well as conducting (or supervising) all analyses and providing statistical interpretation of data
- drafted and revised sections of the manuscript (including the literature review, materials and methods, results and discussion, and all graphs and tables)
 - will have the opportunity to approve the final version before it is published

Theodore Delaca (previously approved as a co-author; **ARIS Log # 235063 and 237469**)

- participated in the conception or design, or analysis and interpretation of data by conducting analyses, collecting data from the initial salmon-potato experiment and recognizing that more information would be needed to clarify a question about possible enzyme interference
- provided important information for the manuscript (including material for the literature review and the materials and methods sections)
- will have the opportunity to approve the final version before it is published

3.) Stabilizing Smoked Salmon Tissue after Extraction of Oil

Katie Hietala (previously approved as a co-author; **ARIS Log # 235061 and 239757**)

- participated in the conception or design, or analysis and interpretation of data by discussing the original experimental design, conducting (or supervising) all data collection, performing statistical analyses and interpreting results
- drafted and revised sections of the manuscript (including the literature review, materials and methods, results and discussion, and all graphs and tables)
- will have the opportunity to approve the final version before it is published

I consider it to be unethical to discriminate against contributing authors solely on the basis of that person lacking a PhD. However, if the PWA Area Director is unable to approve authorship for Theo Delaca, I will remove his name from the publication for the purpose of ARIS entry, thereby allowing us time to readdress this issue in another forum.

Thanks for considering my request to include Katie Hietala, Carl Olsen and Theo Delaca as co-authors on my manuscripts.

Cindy

Cindy Bower
USDA Agricultural Research Service
PO Box 757200
Fairbanks, AK 99775-7200
Phone: (907) 474-6732